CIDOC Annual General Meeting 2011 – Minutes

Time and location:
September 8th, 2011 – 14h30 to 16h45 at Muzeul National Brukenthal, Sibiu (Romania)

Attendees:
34 CIDOC voting members.

Apologies:
Nancy van Asseldonk, Marie-France Cardonna, Martin Doerr, Monika Hagedorn-Saupe, Virgil Nitulescu, Maja Sojat-Bikic

Minutes taken by: Regine Stein

Agenda:

1. Approval of minutes, matters arising, apologies
2. Chair´s report
3. Secretary´s report
4. Financial report
5. Working Group reports and proposals
6. Resolutions
   a. Documentation Principles
   b. URIs for Museum Objects
7. Presentation of CIDOC 2012, Helsinki (Finland)
9. Any other business?
10. Thanks

Beginning of the meeting: 14h30

1. Approval of minutes, matters arising, apologies

   Minutes of the CIDOC AGM 2010 are not yet available and will be approved in 2012.
   Virgil Nitulescu as local organizer and absent board members Nancy van Asseldonk, Marie-France Cardonna, Martin Doerr, Monika Hagedorn-Saupe, Maja Sojat-Bikic give their apologies to the AGM for not being able to attend the meeting.

2. Chair´s report

   Topics:
   - CIDOC Board meeting February 5, 2011 at d’art et d’histoire du Judaisme, Paris
   - ICOM Advisory Board meeting June 6 – 8 2011 at ICOM Paris
   - CIDOC Summer School June 25 - July 1 2011 at Museum of the Texas Tech University, Lubbock, TX, U.S.
See the complete report at http://network.icom.museum/cidoc/organisation/minutes.html.

3. Secretary’s report

- Online access to ICOM Membership database is available since February 2011: This allows for more direct clarification of membership issues with the ICOM secretariat.
- Membership figures as of September 5, 2011:
  - 500 active individual members
  - 85 active institutional members
  - Individual members:
    - 75% in Europe (mostly France – Denmark – Finland)
    - 16,5% America (half South, half North America)
    - 4,2% Africa
    - 2,2% Asia
    - 1,2% Australia
- Cleaning up of the different CIDOC member and CIDOC friends sources is ongoing.
- If anyone did not get any email message from the CIDOC board over the past year: Please get in contact with the Secretary at r.stein@fotomarburg.de.

4. Financial report

To be delivered by Steve.

5. Working Group reports and proposals

The annual Working Group reports are attached. Reports were given as follows:

- Archaeological Sites: Stephen Stead
- Co-Reference: Mika Nyman
  The WG is asking for cooperation of other WG chairs to contribute and join into an initiative for implementing an URI / Co-Reference mechanism.
  Proposal: During the next conference a proper meeting of Working Group chairs should be scheduled to figure out future collaboration and sharing of outcomes on any Linked Data work that is being carried out within CIDOC.
- CRM-SIG: Christian-Emil Ore
  Nick Crofts adds information about the stage of CRM license issues between ICOM and ISO.
- Data Harvesting and Interchange: Erin Coburn
- Digital Preservation: Stefan Rohde-Enslin
- Documentation Standards: Richard Light
- Information Centres: Martina Krug on behalf of Monika Hagedorn-Saupe.
- Transdisciplinary Approaches in Documentation: Siegfried Krause

A new Working Group „Museum Process Implementation“ was founded and approved by the Board during the conference. The Working Group Chair is Walter Koch. Objective and work programme are presented in the proposal here attached.

6. Resolutions
Two resolutions are presented to the AGM for voting:

a. **Statement of Principles of Documentation**
   
   „CIDOC, meeting at its 2011 AGM, supports the Statement of principles of museum documentation. It recommends that the Statement of Principles should be finalized and then put before the 2013 ICOM General Assembly with a view to its adoption as the official policy of ICOM with respect to Articles 2.20 and 6.1 of the ICOM Code of Ethics for Museums.“

   The resolution is approved with 32 „yes“ and 2 abstentions.

b. **Statement on URIs for Museum Objects**
   
   - CIDOC affirms that museums are the sole authority with responsibility for establishing unique URIs based on the contents of their collections; furthermore, institutions are strongly discouraged from creating multiple URIs for the same object.
   - CIDOC encourages its members to actively participate in the further elaboration of the Working Draft of Recommendations for Implementation.
   - CIDOC will table a resolution concerning URIs for Museum Objects for formal approval by ICOM at the 2013 ICOM AGM.

   The resolution is approved with 29 „yes“, 2 „no“ and 3 abstentions.

7. **Presentation of CIDOC 2012, Helsinki (Finland)**
   
   Sirkka Valanto as head of the local organizing committee for CIDOC 2012 in Helsinki presents the conference theme, localities and website. The website is now online at http://www.cidoc2012.fi

   
   **CIDOC 2013:**
   Nick Crofts presents the idea discussed within the board of having proper CIDOC conferences in the years of triennuals, at a different time in a different place than the ICOM General Conference. The board asks the AGM to give a general opinion about the idea.
   The response of the group is as follows:
   3 attendees want to have CIDOC as usual within the ICOM triennial.
   18 attendees want to have a completely separate CIDOC conference in the year of the triennial.
   15 attendees abstain.

   **CIDOC 2014:**
   Whoever is interested in hosting the 2014 conference should submit an application by next year’s conference!

9. **Any other business**
   
   No matters arised.

10. **Thanks**
   
   Board and AGM give their warm thanks to the local organizing committee and all assistants for running a smooth and highly successful conference.

Closing of the meeting: 16h45
CIDOC Chair Report 2011

A word from the chair

2011 was a busy and eventful year for ICOM and for CIDOC. The new board came into office at the 2010 triennial meeting in Shanghai. Thanks to the efforts of our predecessors, we inherited a lively and truly international organisation, an enthusiastic and committed membership and a healthy bank balance. We hope to build on these foundations and ensure that CIDOC fulfils its mission as the professional forum for the field of museum documentation.

CIDOC 2011 Sibiu

The annual conference of ICOM’s International Committee for Documentation, CIDOC 2011, took place in Sibiu Romania, from September 4th – 9th. The conference was attended by an international audience of 120 delegates, spanning all five continents. Simultaneous translation in four languages was available for all the plenary sessions – English, French, Spanish and Romanian. Keynote speakers were Dr Tom Moritz and Prof. Ioan-Aurel Pop. The President of ICOM Dr Hans-Martin Hinz also attended the conference, welcoming delegates to the opening ceremony.

The theme of the conference, “Knowledge management and museums”, focused on one of the most basic and fundamental aspects of museum documentation: the recording and diffusion of all forms of information and the ways in which museums can harness the rich potential of the knowledge they embody. Increasingly, knowledge is being recognised as a valuable resource, one that requires careful management, and recent innovations in information science provide new perspectives on these broad strategic and philosophical issues. The conference provided an opportunity to take stock of recent developments in the theory and techniques of knowledge management, evaluating their impact on documentation practice and examining current tendencies to anticipate future developments.

The city of Sibiu and the conference venues provided an elegant historical backdrop to the conference. Conference events made use of the Brukenthal museum and its annexes, the town hall and other municipal buildings. The conference programme was varied and stimulating, consisting of tutorials, presentations, study visits and social events.

Enriching Cultural Heritage

As I write, preparations are well under way for the 2012 CIDOC conference, which will take place in Helsinki, Finland June 10-14. The main venue is the National museum; some events will take place other, nearby venues, mostly within walking distance. The organisers have put together a lively and varied programme, packed with workshops, tutorials, scientific papers, socials events, study tours and excursions. The keynote speakers will be Nick Poole of the Collections Trust, Ora Lassila, technology strategist at Nokia and Patrick le Boeuf from the Bibliothèque Nationale de France¹. Early registration is open until March 30th, so sign up soon to benefit from the reduced fee.

Getty Foundation Grants

The Getty Foundation again provided CIDOC with a substantial grant in 2011 which allowed us to offer financial support for participants from developing countries to attend the annual conference. Bursaries are calculated to cover the conference registration fee, as well as reasonable travel and

accommodation costs. Fourteen people from ten different countries took advantage of this possibility. By all accounts the recipients, who each provided detailed feedback on their impressions, were very satisfied with the event and hope to return to future conferences. We are immensely grateful both to the Getty Foundation for their generosity, without which these documentation professionals would not have been able to attend, and to the ICOM secretariat for their assistance in preparing the request. We hope to obtain similar support for the 2012 conference in Helsinki. Details will be available on the conference website.

Membership

The long awaited ICOM membership finally came into operation. This new facility provides access to lists of current members with their status, position, preferred language and other details. We are working with ICOM secretariat to consolidate the central database with CIDOC's own mailing lists. Unfortunately, many email addresses are still inaccurate or missing. If you suspect that yours may not be up to date, do please contact either myself or Regine Stein, the CIDOC secretary, so that we can keep in touch.

Thanks in large part to the new database, ICOM was able to provide some interesting statistics covering many aspects of ICOM membership at the executive board meeting in Paris in June.

As of 2010, CIDOC had 481 members – an increase of 6% compared to 2009. This makes CIDOC the seventh largest of the ICOM international committees. This is encouraging, though still a long way from the high point in 1995 when CIDOC had 750 members. And as Christian Emil Ore pointed out in the 2010 newsletter, the potential CIDOC membership is far greater: every museum in the world has at least one staff member responsible for documentation and information management so, logically, CIDOC should have several thousand members. Getting in touch with these potential members and improving CIDOC's visibility is a strategic priority. As a first step, we have asked ICOM to provide us with a list of institutions that are registered with ICOM but for which there is no known CIDOC member.

Another interesting aspect revealed by ICOM's membership statistics is that CIDOC's membership, in common with most other ICOM ICs, is over 80% European. Recent changes in ICOM's policy on membership dues make membership more affordable for participants from developing countries – this presents us with an opportunity to reach out to some areas where CIDOC is not well represented at present.

CIDOC Summer School

CIDOC launched a new initiative in 2011, the CIDOC Summer School. The aim is to provide a comprehensive training programme in museum documentation for both newcomers and experienced documentation professionals. The programme is organised in collaboration with the Museum of Texas Tech University (MTTU). Twelve participants attended the inaugural 2011 CIDOC Summer School that took place from June 25 – July 1 on the MTTU campus. Seven instructors drawn from CIDOC and MTTU faculty and staff delivered a total of ten training modules, forming the core of the basic training programme in documentation principles and practice. Participants also spent one day out of the classroom on study visits to the Palo Duro Canyon State Park and

---

4 http://network.icom.museum/cidoc/archives/past-newsletters.html
5 http://www.tpwd.state.tx.us/spdest/findadest/parks/palo_duro/
the Panhandle Plains Historical Museum. Participants were given a ‘behind the scenes’ tour and met with curators and documentation specialists. Thanks are due to the executive director of MTTU, Dr Eileen Johnson, for welcoming the Summer School to Lubbock and for generously providing staff, facilities and other services, without which the event could not have taken place. The collaboration was mutually beneficial and MTTU has agreed to host additional CIDOC Summer Schools in the future. The 2012 Summer School will take place on the Texas Tech campus May 20 – 25 and we have plans for a 2013 Summer School in Brazil, in conjunction with the ICOM triennial.

ISO licensing agreements

Thanks in large part to the help of Ms Samia Slimani, ICOM’s legal advisor, licensing agreements have now been established with ISO, the International Standards Organisation. These agreements provide a basis for the mutual and non exclusive exchange of ISO standards and the CIDOC standards from which they are derived. One immediate benefit of this is that the CRM Special Interest Group can use ISO translations of the CRM as the basis for their own translations.

CIDOC Statements

An online survey revealed substantial support among CIDOC members for the *Statement of Principles of museum Documentation*, produced by the Documentation Standards Working Group.

The result of a collaborative effort and wide consultation, the Statement can be seen as a detailed development of section 2.20 of the ICOM code of Ethics for Museums, providing a clear and explicit statement of a museum’s legal, ethical and practical obligation to maintain adequate documentation of its collections. The goal is to ensure that museum documentation is clearly recognized as a fundamental requirement for any professional institution.

During the Shanghai conference, the CRM SIG and the co-reference working groups agreed on a *Statement concerning Linked Open Data*, recommendations for museums. These recommendations emphasise the importance of ensuring that museums provide the published identifiers that are needed for linked data applications.

The logical next step is to present these documents for adoption as official ICOM policy. This requires a resolution by the General Assembly during the triennial meeting in 2013. With this in mind, the statements were presented at the ICOM advisory board meeting in June (item 12), and two resolutions were passed at the CIDOC AGM in Sibiu (item 6).

Website

As part of the general overhaul of support services, ICOM now provides a free web-hosting environment for the benefit of International Committees. The opportunity seemed too good to miss so we have migrated the content from the previous web site to the new platform. The URL remains the same: http://cidoc.icom.museum. Many thanks to Richard Light for maintaining the previous website throughout the process. The new site offers some additional features, such as a photo album, forms for surveys and other interactive elements. There are still a few teething problems and missing pages, but we hope you will like the new look. Please let us know if you

---

6 http://panhandleplains.org/pages/home.asp


9 http://icom.museum/fileadmin/user_upload/pdf/Advisory_Minutes/AC_75_minutes_EN.pdf (EN only)

would be interested in contributing to the website in any way.

**CIDOC Newsletter/Bulletin**

Frances Lloyd-Baynes has taken over from Maja Sojat-Bikic as editor of the CIDOC Newsletter. We thank Maja for all her hard work in reintroducing the newsletter in 2006. Frances returns to CIDOC after a few years’ absence, having returned to the USA. Welcome back.

Sibiu, September 8th 2011
Nicholas Crofts
CIDOC Chair
Summary report of activities of the CIDOC-coreference group

This report reflects the period from the CIDOC Shanghai conference, November 2011 to the conference in Sibiu, September 2011. During the reporting period the CIDOC-coreference working group has been focusing on the following areas:

**Generic goals**

- Building a network of partners representing different types of data relevant for development of an infrastructure benefiting from coreference relations and amenable to developing methods for coreference disambiguation.
- Building a project base where the functionality of the coreference infrastructure for URIs can be further developed using real life cases relevant for museums and memory organizations
- Selecting data sets from the repositories curated by the partners
- Within the specific project types developing infrastructures to enable identification and targeted mark-up of resources, URI management and coreference resolution using the data sets provided by the partners.
- Contributing to the creation of persistent, public, resources to enable identification and targeted mark-up or resources, URI management and coreference resolution.

**Main focus areas during the reporting period**

*CIDOC Linked Open Data Guidelines*

- Contributing to the CIDOC Linked Open Data Guidelines for non-digital resources (also called "non-information resources"). Participating in the initial formulation of the text in Shanghai 2010. Reflecting and getting feedback about the recommendation from small museums.

*Prehistoric Rock Art*

- Reasons for selecting rock art as data: sufficient mass – tens of millions of images, covers all inhabited continents, not overcrowded project-wise, realistic starting point with limited local material.
- Creating URIs for prehistoric rock art images. Main partners Swedish rock art archives (Ulf Bertilsson, also member of the UNESCO working group on creating the World
Rock Art Archives), Finnish society for prehistoric art, GIS and 3D experts from Mikkeli University of Applied Sciences, Academic partners. Approached by the eminent French archaeologist, geologist and pre-historian Henry de Lumley, introducing his writings related to the Mont Bego site.

- Building a thematic portal for Nordic and Arctic prehistoric rock art (Finland, Sweden, Norway, Estonia, Russia, Canada). Technical platform in use including tools to handle maps, images and text (including the TEI format).

**Work with text corpora**

- Patching and taking into use the Scholarly Digital Publisher server software for publishing TEI-formatted texts on the web; networking with the developers of the software.

- Investigation in connecting museum objects with original texts: the Gudea statues in the Louvre, the Sumerian Gudea texts i.a. in the Electronic Text Corpus of Sumerian Literature, relevant studies including archaeological materials.

- Taking first steps with processing text corpuses: The State Archives of Assyria. The digital transcriptions of the texts are administered by the University of Helsinki (professor Simo Parpola, Head of Department, Dr. Raija Mattila). Agreement to use a selection of texts for initial experimentation and demonstrations for scholars. The texts are integrated in the The Open Richly Annotated Cuneiform Corpus http://oracc.museum.upenn.edu.

- Networking in Finland with researchers and institutions in Finland committed to using the TEI-format. Key contact internationally: the TEI Ontologies Special Interest Group, Øyvind Eide.

**Participating in projects**

- Processing two-volume monograph “Giuseppe Acerbi, Travels through Sweden, Finland, and Lapland to the North Cape in the years 1798 and 1799” digitized with industrial methods by the Finnish National Library. Creating methods for targeted, layered annotation of text using TEI and creating local authorities.

- “Journey in the Landscape” a project with several academic, museum and SME partners related to creating a GIS-enabled information system for materials about rock art, landscape painting and churches in Finland.

**CIDOC related teaching**

- The University of Jyväskylä, Department of Art and Culture
- The University of Tampere, School of Information Sciences

**Participating in events**

Participating in applications for funding

- MEMORLINK – Context and Relevance in Linked Data Infrastructures. Academy of Finland call for researchers within the thematic areas of the Strategic Centres for Science, Technology and Innovation. Core partners the Industrial Ontologies Group, Library of the University of Jyväskylä, participants from The University of Tampere, School of Information Sciences and the National Archives of Finland.
- CultureCloud, an EU project proposal in the ICT PSP 2011 “Aggregating Content for Europeana”.

Sibiu, 4th September, 2011

Mika Nyman
Chair, CIDOC Co-reference Working Group
CIDOC Working Group Data Harvesting and Interchange

WG report at the CIDOC Annual General Meeting 2011

After the release of the LIDO specification version 1.0 during last year’s CIDOC conference, the Data Harvesting and Interchange Working Group had its first official meeting this week.

Over the past year our work has been focused on disseminating information about LIDO, creating further material on the website, running workshops in various countries, and extending the network and the practical implementation of LIDO.

Work was also carried out on two items aiming at deeper understanding of the LIDO schema:

- the full mapping of the LIDO XML Schema to the CIDOC-CRM and
- the drafting of LIDO profiles for various collection types.

Both items were addressed during this week’s meetings.

At Monday’s meeting, Sept 5th 2011, approximately 25 people were in attendance.

We introduced the working group and encouraged people to join the listserv, which serves as the primary means for communicating throughout the year.

We then had a discussion about whether we should have a list of recommended event terminology for LIDO. ATHENA has already produced a list, which we looked at.

It was agreed that we should have a recommended list of terminology; that we should circulate ATHENA’s list and descriptions for comment, with the goal of ultimately approving it; and that we should assign this terminology with a URI from the LIDO namespace.

Next we looked at the mapping between LIDO and CRM, and addressed a variety of issues and questions that were pending.

Finally, we had a lively debate about whether there should be a LIDO RDF version, or if the CIDOC CRM should be used instead. The WG is not ready to make a recommendation on this issue.

On Tuesday, Sept 6th 2011, approximately 20 people gathered for the second meeting.

We began the meeting by having an open discussion on topics and questions from the members.

We then discussed whether LIDO should have profiles for various collection types, which essentially are recommendations for what elements to include.

There was strong support for including these profiles. The German Data Exchange Working Group has already produced a set of profiles for LIDO. The WG is now tasked with evaluating them. Once complete, the profiles will be available as supplementary documentation on the website.

Our thanks to all the participants for their support and contributions to the WG.

Erin Coburn and Regine Stein
Documentation Standards WG

- Discussed potential challenges for cultural history Linked Data
- Identified a number of areas to examine further, e.g.
  - Uncertain dates and date ranges. Need to specify date system
  - Place boundaries changing over time
  - Styles, artistic movements: rich authority records for e.g. artistic styles containing geo-temporal information as linked data
  - Multi-part objects: linking to correct part
Proposed work plan

- Use CIDOC forum for discussions: open to all
- Complete and tidy up initial list of challenges
- Consult
  - internally with other CIDOC WGs
  - with relevant ICOM ICs
  - with cultural history Linked Data projects
- Draft and publish Linked Data design patterns where there is sufficient consensus
Format of a design pattern

- Following Dodds and Davis
  - Pattern name
  - Description of challenge
  - Context
  - Solution
  - Examples
  - Discussion
  - Related patterns
Short report from the Information Centres Working Group at CIDOC 2011

On Monday the Information Centres Working Group met. It had eight participants, mostly coming from some kind of museum advisory institution. As we know the way museum advisory institutions are organized in very different ways.

The meeting started with a round-table who the participants were, and what are there current issues concerning museum information.
Out of this the following topics arose:
- in many museums there is not a complete documentation available of their collection – even not a traditional paper-based one
- therefore there is an ongoing need to talk about the relevance, collection documentation has
- museums need support for digitisation
- museums need support for publishing object information online
- the IPR issue has to be addressed

In fact there is a need for financial support, but most of the advisory bodies cannot provide funding
There exist guidelines and recommendations but quite often they are not used. So the question was what can museum advisory institutions do? One possibility could be that we try to publish best practice examples and implement low-cost projects which provide practical results and can motivate others to do something even if no additional money is available.

The second topic which was tackled during the meeting was – a short information on the Enumerate project, which is currently co-funded by the European Commission in order to develop a methodology and an instrument to measure the state, the needs and the impact of digitisation of Cultural Heritage in the EU. Working Group members present offered to support this initiative in their respective countries.
The meeting concluded with the plan to be in contact beginning next year in order to prepare the WG meeting in Helsinki next year.

Monika Hagedorn-Saupe
WG chair museum information centres

Objective:
The working groups aims at implementing reference workflows for main business processes as found in museums, galleries and similar organisations. The elaborated work flows should constitute a basis on which museums of different kind and size can build up their own workflows adapted to their special needs. The design of the workflows is based on the BPMN (Business Process Modelling Notation) which has been standardized in 2010 by OMG (Object Modelling Group). To elaborate the workflows an open source tool will be used which converts the graphical design into an XML presentation which directly can be executed by native BPMN processing engines.

Work Programme:
The working Group (WG) identifies core processes which are used in museums and develops generic workflow models derived from these core processes. These models will be elaborated using a graphical open source tool (“BPMN Designer”) and implemented on open source BPMN processing engine. The models are reference models (aka “CIDOC Process References” – CPR) which can be adapted to the needs of museums using a BPMN Designer. The WG will test the elaborated models in praxis and will develop guidelines how to implement the workflow models in museums (“CPR – Best Practice Guide”). The models will be tested against existing standards.
In a second phase the process models will be extended by a data model comprising all data to be entered during different steps of different processes delivering a reference model for collection management systems.

Members as of 2011-09-06:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>David Cigánek</th>
<th>Martina Krug</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moravian museum, Methodological Centre for IT in Museology</td>
<td>Städtisches Museum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zelný trh 6</td>
<td>Schlossplatz 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>659 37 Brno</td>
<td>34346 Hann. Münden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nicholas Crofts</th>
<th>Dan Matei</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23c avenue Miremont</td>
<td>National Heritage Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1206 Geneva</td>
<td>str. Ienachita Vacaescu, Nr. 16 Sector 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>Bucharest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Romania</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yolande Deckers</th>
<th>Hans Rengman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Koninklijk Museum voor schone Kunsten</td>
<td>Head of content quality at KMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plaatsnijderstraat 2</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-2000 Antwerpen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Walter Koch (Chair)</th>
<th>Stephen Stead</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Angewandte Informationstechnik Forschungs GmbH</td>
<td>Paveprime Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klosterwiesgasse 32/1</td>
<td>35 Downs Court Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-8010 Graz</td>
<td>Purley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>Surrey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CR8 1BF, UK</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>